

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO
EASTERN DIVISION

JAMES E. SHELTON,)	Judge Christopher A. Boyko
)	
Plaintiff,)	Case No. 1:19-cv-01205
)	
v.)	
)	
BLINDBID INC., dba TCPA LITIGATOR)	
LIST, et al.)	
)	
Defendants,)	
_____)	

DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT
PURSUANT TO FED. Rs. CIV. P. 12(b)(1), (2), and (6)

Defendants, Blindbid Inc. ("Blindbid") and Michael O'Hare ("O'Hare") (collectively, "Defendants"), move this Court to dismiss Plaintiff, James E. Shelton's ("Plaintiff") Complaint under Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1), (2) and (6). A Memorandum in Support is attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Respectfully Submitted:

DINN HOCHMAN & POTTER, LLC:

/s/ Benjamin D. Carnahan
BENJAMIN D. CARNAHAN (0079737)
5910 Landerbrook Drive, Suite 200
Cleveland, Ohio 44124
T: 440-446-1100
F: 440-446-1240
bcarnahan@dhplaw.com
Attorneys for Defendants

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iv
STATUTES AND RULES.....	viii
INTRODUCTION.....	1
STANDARDS OF REVIEW.....	3
A. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1) Standard.....	3
B. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(2) Standard.....	5
C. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) Standard.....	6
ARGUMENT AND AUTHORITY.....	7
A. Plaintiff's Complaint Should Be Dismissed for Lack of Article III Standing.....	7
1. Plaintiff Lacks Constitutional Standing Because He Has Suffered No Concrete Injury.....	7
2. Plaintiff Lacks Prudential Standing Because His Claims Are Outside the Zone of Interests of FCRA.....	10
B. Defendants Should Be Dismissed From This Action for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction.....	11
1. No Basis Exists Under the Ohio Long-Arm Statute to Exercise Personal Jurisdiction Over Defendants.....	11
2. Exercising Personal Jurisdiction Over Defendants Cannot Comport With Due Process Requirements.....	12
a. Defendants are not subject to general personal jurisdiction because they do not have continuous and systematic contacts with Ohio.....	13
b. Defendants are not subject to specific personal jurisdiction.....	15
C. Plaintiff's Complaint Fails to State a Claim Under FCRA.....	16

1. The Allegations in the Complaint Do Not Plausibly Relate to Consumer "Credit"	17
2. The TCPA Litigator List is Not a "Consumer Report"	17
3. Defendants are Not a "Consumer Reporting Agency"	18

D. Plaintiff's Complaint Fails to State a Claim Against Defendant Michael O'Hare in His Individual Capacity.....	19
E. Because Plaintiff's FCRA Claim Fails to State a Claim, Plaintiff's CSPA Claim Fails to State a Claim.....	20
CONCLUSION.....	20
LOCAL RULE 7(f) CERTIFICATION.....	21
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE.....	21

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

<i>Air Prods. & Controls, Inc. v. Safetech Int'l, Inc.</i> , 503 F.3d 544 (6th Cir. 2007).....	6, 15
<i>Anthony Domenic Reo v. Palmer Admin. Servs.</i> , N.D. Ohio No. 1-18-CV-2065.....	1
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 129 S. Ct. 1937 (2009).....	6
<i>Bank of America Corp. v. City of Miami, Fla.</i> , 137 S.Ct. 1296 (2017).....	10
<i>Bell Atl. Corp. v. Twombly</i> , 550 U.S. 544 (2007).....	6
<i>Binno v. Am. Bar Ass'n.</i> , 826 F.3d. 338 (6 th Cir. 2016).....	4
<i>Bird v. Parsons</i> , 289 F.3d 865, 871 (6th Cir. 2002).....	12, 14
<i>Burger King Corp. v. Rudzewicz</i> , 471 U.S. 462, 474 (1985).....	5, 12
<i>Calphalon Corp. v. Rowlette</i> , 228 F.3d 718, 721-723 (6th Cir. 2000).....	15
<i>Cheatham v. McCormick</i> , 100. F.3d. 956, 1996WL662887, at *2 (6 th Cir. 1996).....	18
<i>City of Los Angeles v. Lyons</i> , 461 U.S. 95, 101 (1983).....	4
<i>CompuServe, Inc. v. Patterson</i> , 89 F.3d 1257, 1261-62 (6th Cir. 1996).....	5, 15
<i>Conley v. Gibson</i> , 355 U.S. 41 (1957).....	6
<i>Conn v. Zakharov</i> , 667 F.3d 705, 712-13 (6th Cir. 2012).....	6, 12, 13
<i>Filtrexx International, LLC v. Truelsen</i> , No. 5:12-cv-58, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 19536 (N.D. Ohio Feb. 13, 2012).....	16
<i>Glenn v. Holder</i> , 738 F.Supp. 718, 724 (E.D. Mich 2010).....	4
<i>Hagy v. Demers & Adams</i> , 882 F.3d. 616, 623 (6 th Cir. 2018).....	9
<i>Harris v. Lloyds TSB Bank, PLC</i> , 281 Fed. Appx. 489, 494 (6th Cir. 2008).....	15
<i>Helicopteros Nacionales de Colombia S.A., v. Hall</i> , 466 U.S. 408 (1984).....	13
<i>Howell Contractors, Inc. v. Berling</i> , 383 S.W.3d. 465, 467 (Ky.Ct.App. 2012).....	19

<i>Huff v. Telecheck Services, Inc.</i> , 923 F.3d. 458, 2019WL1967707 (6 th Cir., decided May 3, 2019).....	8, 9, 10
<i>In re Appalachian Fuels, LLC</i> , 493 B.R. 1 (6 th Cir. BAP 2013).....	19
<i>In re Phillips</i> , 139 P.3d. 639, 644 (2006).....	19
<i>Int’l Shoe Co. v. State of Wash., Office of Unemployment Comp. & Placement</i> , 326 U.S. 310, 316 (1945).....	5, 12, 13
<i>Ippolito v. WNS, Inc.</i> , 864 F.2d 440, 449 (7th Cir.1988).....	18
<i>Jarnagin v. Busby, Inc.</i> , 867 P.2d. 63, 69 (Colo. App. 1993).....	20
<i>Johnson v. Wells Fargo Home Mortgage, Inc.</i> , 558 F. Supp. 2d 1114, 1122 (D. Nev. 2008).....	11
<i>Kerry Steel, Inc. v. Paragon Indus., Inc.</i> , 106 F.3d 147, 149 (6th Cir. 1997).....	13, 15
<i>LAK, Inc. v. Deer Creek Enters.</i> , 885 F.2d 1293, 1298 (6th Cir. 1989).....	6
<i>Lexmark Int’l Inc. v. Static Control Components, Inc.</i> , 134 S. Ct. 1377, 1388 (2014)...	10
<i>Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife</i> , 504 U.S. 555, 560 (1992).....	4, 7, 8
<i>Lyshe v. Levy</i> , 854 F.3d. 855, 857 (2017 6 th Cir.).....	4
<i>Lyshe v. Levy</i> , 854 F.3d. 855, 861-62 (2017 6 th Cir.).....	4, 7
<i>Nationwide Mut. Ins. Co. v. Tryg Int’l Ins. Co., Ltd.</i> , 91 F.3d 790, 793 (6th Cir. 1996).....	5
<i>Neogen Corp. v. Neo Gen Screening, Inc.</i> , 282 F.3d 883, 888 (6th Cir. 2002).....	5
<i>Plunderbund</i> , 312 F.Supp.3d. at 559.....	4
<i>Plunderbund Media LLC v. DeWine</i> , 312 F.Supp.3d. 654, 659 (N.D. Ohio 2018).....	3, 4
<i>Reo v. Palmer Admin. Servs.</i> , 6 th Cir. Case No. 18-3924 (May 30, 2019).....	1
<i>S. Mach. Co. v. Mohasco Indus., Inc.</i> , 401 F.2d 374, 381 (6th Cir. 1968).....	15, 16
<i>Shelton v. Direct Energy LP, et al.</i> , E.D. PA Case No. 2:18-cv-4375, Doc. 13-1,	

p. 12.....	1
<i>Shelton v. Direct Energy LP</i> , N.D. Ohio No. 1:19-CV-81, Declaration of James Everett Shelton (February 13, 2019), Doc. 46-1, ¶ 4, 8, 21.....	2
<i>Shelton v. Nat'l Student Debt Assist, LLC, et al.</i> , E.D. PA Case No. 2:18-cv-0254 (MSG), Doc. No. 15-1, p. 14.....	1
<i>Soehnlen v. Fleet Owners Insurance Fund</i> , 844 F.3d. 576, 579-80 (6 th Cir. 2016).....	4, 7
<i>Spokeo, Inc. v. Robins</i> , 136 S. Ct. 1540, 1549 (2016), as revised (May 24, 2016).....	4, 7, 8, 9, 10
<i>Stoops v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.</i> , 197 F. Supp.3d 782 (W.D. PA 2016).....	10
<i>Theunissen v. Matthews</i> , 935 F.2d 1454, 1458 (6th Cir. 1991).....	5
<i>Third Nat'l Bank in Nashville v. WEDGE Group, Inc.</i> , 882 F.2d 1087, 1089 (6th Cir.1989), <i>cert. denied</i> , 493 U.S. 1058, 110 S. Ct. 870, 107 L.Ed.2d 953 (1990).....	16
<i>Trans Union Corp. v. Federal Trade Comm'n</i> , 81 F.3d 228, 231 (D.C.Cir.1996).....	18
<i>UPS Worldwide Forwarding, Inc. v. U.S. Postal Serv.</i> , 66 F.3d 621, 626 (3d Cir. 1995).....	10
<i>US ex. rel. Bledsoe v. Community Health Systems, Inc.</i> 342 F.3d. 634, 643 (6 th Cir. 2003).....	15
<i>Warth v. Seldin</i> , 422 U.S. 490, 498 (1975).....	4
<i>Weller v. Cromwell Oil Co.</i> , 504 F.2d 927, 930 (6th Cir. 1974).....	5
<i>World-Wide Volkswagen Corp. v. Woodson</i> , 444 U.S. 286, 291 (1980).....	5
<i>Yuhasz v. Brush Wellman, Inc.</i> , 341 F.3d 559, 564 (6 th Cir. 2003).....	15
<i>Zoya v. NIOS, Inc.</i> , No. 1:13-CV-00780-DCN, 2013 WL 4511922, at *2 (N.D. Ohio Aug. 23, 2013).....	5, 12, 13 14, 15

STATUTES AND RULES

15 U.S.C. § 1681a(d)(1).....	17
15 U.S.C. § 1681a(f).....	19
15 U.S.C. § 1681a(f)(2)(A)(i).....	18
15 U.S.C. § 1681a(r).....	17
15 U.S.C. § 1681(g).....	8, 16
15 U.S.C. § 1691a(d).....	17
15 U.S.C. § 1691a(d)(1).....	17
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1).....	3, 10, 11
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(2).....	3, 5, 6
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6).....	3, 6
Ohio Rev. Code §2307.382.....	6, 11